

## **PLANNING COMMITTEE**

### **Minutes of the Meeting held on 18 May 2017 at 4.30 pm**

#### **Present:**

Councillor S J Pugsley .....Chairman  
Councillor B Maitland-Walker .....Vice Chairman

Councillor I Aldridge  
Councillor S Dowding  
Councillor S Goss  
Councillor A Hadley  
Councillor B Heywood

Councillor A Kingston-James  
Councillor P Murphy  
Councillor J Parbrook  
Councillor K Turner  
Councillor T Venner  
Councillor R Woods

#### **Officers in Attendance:**

Area Planning Manager – Bryn Kitching  
Planning Officer – Sue Keal  
Planning Officer (Conservation) – Elizabeth Peeks  
Legal Advisor Brian Convery – Shape Partnership Services  
Democratic Services Officer – Tracey Meadows

The Chairman welcomed Councillor Kingston-James to his first meeting of the Planning Committee.

#### **P1 Apologies for Absence**

There were apologies from Councillors Jones, Mills and Morgan. Councillor Hadley substituted for Councillor Mills.

#### **P2 Minutes**

**Resolved** that the Minutes of the Planning Committee Meeting held on the 30 March 2017 circulated at the meeting be confirmed as a correct record.

Proposed by Councillor Heywood, seconded by Councillor Maitland-Walker

**The motion was carried.**

#### **P3 Declarations of Interest or Lobbying**

Councillor Murphy declared that he had been lobbied in favour of application No. 3/37/17/012. He declared that the application had been discussed at the previous planning meeting which he had not been present at. He declared that he would keep an open mind. Councillor Venner declared that he had been lobbied on application No. 3/21/17/025 by local residents and he also knew the area very well and had friends that lived on the estate. He declared that he would keep an open mind on the application. Councillor Dowding declared that the applicant for application No's. 3/11/16/003 and 3/11/16/005 was the Parish meeting Chairman. He also declared a personal interest as he was a member of both friends of Quantock and the Quantock Hills joint advisory committee, he stated that neither group had spoken to him about the application.

**P4 Public Participation**

| <b>Min No.</b> | <b>Reference No.</b> | <b>Application</b>   | <b>Name</b>   | <b>Position</b>  | <b>Stance</b>  |
|----------------|----------------------|--|---|--|--|
| P5             | 3/11/16/003          | Conversion of redundant agricultural buildings to form 7 no. Dwellings with associated works and alterations to access from a bridleway to the A39, Townsend Farm, Williton to Bridgwater Road, East Quantoxhead | Lord Darling  | On behalf of East Quantoxhead Estate   | Infavour   |
| P5             | 3/11/16/005          | Conversion of redundant agricultural buildings to form 7 no. Dwellings with associated works and alterations to access from a bridleway to the A39, Townsend Farm, Williton to Bridgwater Road, East Quantoxhead | Lord Darling  | On behalf of East Quantoxhead Estate   | Infavour   |
| P5             | 3/26/17/004          | Variation of Condition No. 2 (to allow additional car boot sales on Wednesday's until the end of September each year) of application 3/26/12/012, Home Farm, Blue Anchor, Minehead                               |   |  |  |
| P5             | 3/26/17/008          | Variation of Condition No.02 (approved plans of application 3/26/14/012. The White Horse Inn, Torre Rocks, Washford, Old Cleeve, Watchet   | Jane Hood<br><br>Dr Teresa Bridgman<br><br>Geoff Williams<br><br>Cllr Dewdney | Neighbour<br><br>On behalf of Old Cleeve Parish Council<br><br>On behalf of Old Cleeve Parish Council<br><br>Ward Member | Objecting<br><br>Objecting<br><br>Objecting<br><br>Objecting |
| P5             | 3/37/17/012          | Erection of a first floor extension over the garage and  | Mr Andrew Beasley   | Neighbour  | Objecting  |

|    |             |  |  |   |  |
|----|-------------|--|--|---|--|
|    |             | carport to be used as an annex (resubmission of 3/37/17/001), The Outback, 9A Reed Close, Watchet  | Mr David King<br>Mr Walsh  | Neighbour<br>Applicant  | Objecting<br>Infavour  |
| P5 | 3/39/17/009 | Variation of Condition No.2 (approved plans) of application 3/39/16/007. Land at Larviscombe Road, Williton  |  |   |  |
| P5 | 3/21/17/025 | Replacement of bungalow with the erection of a single storey 6 No. bedroomed building for assisted living, annexed to Dene Lodge Nursing Home, 19 Dunster Close, Alcombe, Minehead | Mr Padfield<br>Mrs Green<br>Mr Michael Kingston-Lee<br>Miss Julia Worth<br>Chris Pickerill<br>Mr Julian Sykes- Brown | Neighbour<br>Neighbour<br>Neighbour<br>Neighbour<br>Neighbour<br>Neighbour<br>Applicant | Objecting<br>Objecting<br>Objecting<br>Objecting<br>Objecting<br>Objecting<br>Infavour |

## **P5 Town and Country Planning Act 1990 and Other Matters**

Report One of the Planning Team dated 10 May 2017 (circulated with the Agenda). The Committee considered the reports, prepared by the Planning Team, relating to plans deposited in accordance with the planning legislation and, where appropriate, Members were advised of correspondence received and subsequent amendments since the agenda had been prepared.

(Copies of all letters reported may be inspected in the planning application files that constitute part of the background papers for each item).

**RESOLVED** That the Recommendations contained in Section 1 of the Report be Approved (in so far as they relate to the above), including, where appropriate, the conditions imposed and the reasons for refusal, subject to any amendments detailed below:

### **Reference      Location, Proposal, Debate and Decision**

**3/11/16/003 – Conversion of redundant agricultural buildings to form 7 No. dwellings with associated works and alterations to access from a bridleway to the A39. Townsend Farm, Williton to Bridgwater Road, East Quantoxhead, Bridgwater, TA5 1EH**

### **Comments by member of the public;**

- Natural England had granted Heritage status to the estate, thus allowing the whole estate to be kept together and likely to retain its heritage interest should planning permission be granted;
- The proposed dwellings were proposed to be permanent homes, not holiday lets or second homes;

- Conversion to housing would be the best option for these redundant agricultural buildings, conversion would be done by ourselves and added to the estate housing stock to let, they would not be sold;

**The Member's debate centred on the following issues;**

- The Status Quo of present buildings were unacceptable;
- Pleased to see that there were a minimum amount of lights on the roofs, thus preventing light pollution;
- Happy to see that links were being maintained with the farming community;
- The AONB comments stating that old agricultural buildings should be maintained unchanged despite the end of their serviceable lives was desirable but not practical;
- Unhappy with the Bridle Way crossing the A39, this was hugely dangerous;
- A worthy application for the preservation of old redundant farm buildings;
- Important that the swallows were not disturbed during the nesting period;
- Would like to see that Oil tanks and waste bins were dealt with sympathetically as this would look unsightly in a court yard setting;
- Concerns that there was no public transport for this development;
- A lot of thought had gone into how these buildings can be sympathetically designed to fit in with the surrounding area;
- No information in the report on how the leat to the old water mill would be preserved for the future;
- Concerns that there were no comments from the Parish meeting, local residents views were pertinent;
- Had the estate considered permitting live and work lettings to encourage rural enterprise into the area as that would have more affinity with farming than domestic use;
- Disappointed that affordable housing element had been negated;

**Reference    Location, Proposal, Debate and Decision**

**3/11/16/005 – Conversion of redundant agricultural buildings to form 7 No. dwellings with associated works and alterations to access from a bridleway to the A39. Townsend Farm, Williton to Bridgwater Road, East Quantoxhead, Bridgwater, TA5 1EH**

Councillor Dowding proposed and Councillor Heywood seconded a motion that both applications be **APPROVED**

The **motion** was carried

**Reference    Location, Proposal, Debate and Decision**

**3/26/17/004 – Variation of Condition No. 2 (to allow additional car boot sales on Wednesdays until end of September each year) of application 3/26/12/012. Home Farm, Blue Anchor, Minehead, TA24 6JS**

**The Member's debate centred on the following issues;**

- Concerned that the car boot sales were already being held outside of the original agreement;
- There was sympathy for the nearest neighbour, however this event was popular and brought economic value to the community;
- The car boot season was going on longer than it used to and was a good way to recycle unwanted items and should be welcomed;
- Concerns regarding the lack of access for emergency vehicles;
- Concerns that one of the emergency escape routes was secured by barbed wire by the adjoining property;

Councillor Turner proposed and Councillor Heywood seconded a motion that the application be **Approved** with the added condition that no car boot sales shall take place on any Wednesday during September until such time as details to show the emergency access and evacuation routes have been submitted to, and approved to the Local Planning Authority.

The **motion** was carried

#### **Reference    Location, Proposal, Debate and Decision**

**3/26/17/008 - Variation of Condition No. 02 (approved plans of application 3/26/14/012). The White Horse Inn, Torre Rocks, Washford, Old Cleeve, Watchet, TA23 0JZ**

#### **Comments by members of the public;**

- Concerned that the Landlords were already occupying the building and not going to use it as a bed and breakfast facility;
- A three bedroom house had been built in the open countryside against the Local Plan;
- The Landlord has built a timber framed kit building with no intention of compliance with the planning scheme;
- Lack of communication between Planning and Building Control departments;

#### **The Member's debate centred on the following issues;**

- The applicant had flouted the planning permission that was originally granted with regards to the internal layout;
- The building should be taken down and erected as per original planning application;
- The way that this building has now been erected was a new dwelling in the open countryside against Planning Policy;

Councillor Murphy proposed and Councillor Turner seconded a motion that the application be **REFUSED**

#### **Reason**

The site is located in the open countryside and outside of existing settlements where development is not generally appropriate. The development as built is tantamount to a new residential dwelling that would fail to bring forward sufficient economic benefits to the existing rural business, particularly when judged against

the permitted B&B use. Therefore the proposal is unsustainable development and fails to meet the requirements of policy OC/1 of the West Somerset Local Plan to 2032.

The **Motion** was carried

### **Reference    Location, Proposal, Debate and Decision**

**3/37/17/012 - Erection of a first floor extension over the garage and carport to be used as an annex (resubmission of 3/37/17/001). The Outback, 9A Reed Close, Watchet, TA23 0EE**

#### **Comments by members of the public;**

- Overbearing and overlooking;
- A hedge boundary would not obscure this extension;
- This extension should not be built at the expense of residential amenity;
- The Ground floor of the garage could be converted into an annex;
- The extension was not in keeping with the area due to its design and size;

#### **The Member's debate centred on the following issues;**

- Application still had a degree of overbearing and overlooking to the neighbouring property;
- A ground floor extension would be more suitable;
- Applicant listened to the objections of the previous application and had made serious modifications to the building;
- There was room on the site to accommodate this application;
- The size of the property was not a reason to refuse this application;

Councillor Aldridge proposed and Councillor Turner seconded a motion that the application be **APPROVED** as per Officer Recommendation for approval, the Motion **FAILED**

Councillor Woods proposed and Councillor Hadley seconded a motion that the application be **REFUSED**

The motion to **REFUSE** the application was carried

#### **Reason**

Due to the height of the proposed extension and its proximity to the bungalows at 21, 22 and 23 Admirals Close, it is considered that the development would be overbearing to those properties. This would represent an unacceptable loss of residential amenity to those properties and be contrary to the provisions of Policy SC1 of the West Somerset Local Plan to 2032 and Retained Saved Policy BD/3 of the West Somerset Local Plan (2006)

The **Motion** was carried

### **Reference    Location, Proposal, Debate and Decision**

**3/39/17/009 - Variation of Condition No. 2 (approved plans) of application 3/39/16/007. Land at Larviscombe Road, Williton, TA4 4SA**

**The Member's debate centred on the following issues;**

- We could not put a condition on for these garages to not be used for storage;
- There would not be any significant adverse impact upon visual or residential amenity;

Councillor Hadley proposed and Councillor Parbrook seconded a motion that the application be **APPROVED**

The **Motion** was carried

**Reference    Location, Proposal, Debate and Decision**

**3/21/17/025 – Replacement of bungalow with the erection of a single storey 6 No. single bedroomed building for assisted living, annexed to Dene Lodge Nursing Home, 19 Dunster Close, Alcombe**

**Comments by members of the public;**

- This was purely a residential area with all three roads leading to Cul-De-Sacs meaning that all traffic would need to come via Dene Gardens;
- Over development of the bungalow;
- Change of use from a 3 bedroomed family bungalow to a residential fee paying unit;
- Concerns with the party wall and adjacent garage;
- Development would impact on the whole estate causing great distress to the elderly residents who live there;
- The development would set a precedent for commercial use on the estate;
- The development would change the look of the whole estate and properties would depreciate in value;
- A covenant was signed by the residents to keep the estate residential with no trade or profession in any outbuildings;
- Problems with staff from Dene Lodge parking in Dene Gardens;
- Many other properties were available in Minehead for residential care;
- Concerns with construction traffic;
- This was a large plot screaming out for something to be done with it;
- This development would be for assisted living for 6 elderly residents with a warden and 1-2 staff on hand to assist if needed;
- This development would take away some of the burden away from Social Services;
- This could be the start of something very good for Somerset;

**The Member's debate centred on the following issues;**

- This was a complicated site to see the size and scale of the development that was proposed;
- Parking arrangements were a big issue;

- Concerns with access arrangements;

Councillor Parbrook proposed and Councillor Maitland-Walker seconded a motion the application be **deferred** to allow a site visit to take place on the 26 June 2017 to see how the impact of the building would be set out on the surrounding area.

The **Motion** was carried

## **P6 Exmoor National Park Matters**

Councillor B Heywood reported on matters relating to West Somerset considered at the meeting on 4 April and the 2 May 2017 of the Exmoor National Park Planning Committee. This included:

### **6/40/16/114**

Proposed succession farm dwelling (Full), Hoe Farm, Wheddon Cross, Minehead – Application Approved

### **6/24/17/101**

Proposed change of use and conversion of old redundant agricultural barn to a camping barn (Full) – Windwhistle Barn, Windwhistle Lane, Sticklepath, Watchet – Application Approved

There were no appeals lodged and one appeal decision, The Studio, Bessom Bridge, Wimbleball Lake, Brompton Regis – Appeal dismissed.

### **62/11/16/007**

Change of use of agricultural building to three extended family dwellings (Retrospective) (Amended Description) – Hallslake Farm, Brendon – Refused

### **6/9/16/131**

Reserve matters application in respect of a proposed agricultural dwelling (outline application 6/9/106/109) – Springfield Farm, Draydon Lane, Dulverton, Somerset - Approved

### **6/27/17/105**

Proposed vehicle hard standing for one vehicle. Re-submission of refused application 6/27/16/113 (Householder) – Peace Cottage, Porlock Weir Road, Porlock, Somerset - Approved

### **6/15/17/101**

Proposed farmhouse, detached garage including secure store and associated works (replacement of existing temporary dwelling) (Full) – Higher Weekfield Farm, Armour Lane, Exton, Dulverton, Somerset – Delegated to Officers

### **WTCA 17/07**

Works to Tree in Conservation Area: Removal of branch from birch tree in the garden of Exmoor House (WTCA) – Exmoor House, Dulverton, Somerset - Approved

### **6/27/17/104**

Application for stoned wheel runs, level platform area and turning bay (Retrospective) (Full) – Land north of A39, Porlock Hill, Porlock, Somerset – Application deferred.

No appeals decided or lodged

**P7 Delegated Decision List** (replies from Officers are in italic)

3/21/16/11 – Tikoh and Rosslea, Bircham Road, Minehead – stated that this application maybe relevant to the next site visit.

**P8 Appeals Lodged**

No appeals lodged

**P9 Appeals Decided**

3/21/16/056 – Erection of single storey extension at 9B King Edward Road, Minehead, TA24 5EA – Appeal Allowed

3/21/16/055 – Erection of detached dwelling with associated vehicle parking and garden at 62 king George Road, Minehead, TA21 Appeal Dismissed.

The meeting closed at 8.07pm